

ACT LIGHT RAIL COST ESTIMATES (11 MARCH 2024) STAGES 1 & 2

Purpose

This document provides and discusses the latest independent cost estimates by Smart Canberra Transport and Australian Logistics Study Centre (ALSC) for ACT light rail Stages 1 and 2, based mostly on information released by the ACT Government, reports in the media and on independent life-cycle cost analysis. However, it should be noted by readers that the ACT Government is parsimonious at best in release of any cost information and contract details in respect of light rail.

This review was prompted by the release on 7 December 2023 of the contract price for the Delivery Phase of Stage2A, at \$577M for 1.7 km of track, which was a watering eye-opener. This figure is over twice the estimate of \$254M, made previously in the update of 21 May 2023.

Stage 1

Stage 1(Gungahlin-Civic) followed the Parliamentary Agreement between the Greens and Labor after the 2012 election that construction of Stage 1 would start before the 2016 election, which it did. It has been operating since April 2019, quite successfully, given the effects of the unpredicted COVID-19 pandemic which cut patronage considerably. Best annual patronage to date has been 4.6 million. Given a 20-year cost of \$1.78B, being \$89M a year, the passenger subsidy is \$19.34 per boarding. However, note that, because the ACT Government made a lump-sum payment on commissioning of \$350M, the annual budget figure averages about \$71.15 ((1.78-.350/20).

One should note also that for Stage 1, it has been estimated that some \$100M has been expended in off-main contract costs directly attributable to Stage 1, namely for consultancies, works and project management, giving a total estimated cost (2016 dollars) of \$1.88B.

Stage 2

Stage 2 – Civic to Woden was announced in a brain snap, during an 11th hour, 2016 election speech by the Chief Minister.

Once the sheer difficulty and probable cost of Stage 2 dawned on the Government after the 2016 election, the Government split Stage 2 into two sub-stages, with Stage 2A limited to a technically feasible but expensive leg from Civic to Regatta Point.

Detailed, revised estimates for Stage 2A and 2B are shown in **Table 2**.

Stage 2A

Although only 1.7Km¹, it is very expensive in incurring the decision to raise London Circuit and install a complicated intersection at a cost of some \$100M. In addition, there would be a bridge needed across Parkes Way and upgrading of the Acton waterfront, as well as the purchase of five additional trams and modification of the existing 14 trams.

In respect of raising London Circuit, one should note that it was not really needed for light rail but, rather, was a political decision to capture the valuable land now taken up by the clover-leaf access to Commonwealth Ave.

The Canberra Times (8Dec23) reported a contract price for Light Rail Stage 2A of \$577M, of which \$519M was for "Building and Facility Construction and Maintenance Services", albeit the composition of these is unknown. In the absence of government clarifications, this figure is taken not to include a 20-year Operations & Maintenance (O&M) cost. Nor does it include the cost of raising London Circuit (\$82M) and myriad other related contracts and administration. See the detailed list (and references) under Stage 2A in Table 2 [Part 1].

The \$577M contract figure for Stage 2A grossly misrepresents the real total costs associated with this project. From Table 2 [Part 1], Stage 2A will in fact attract total build and related expenditures totalling \$1.29B,

| 1 | Km | = | kil | om | etre |
|---|----|---|-----|----|------|
|---|----|---|-----|----|------|

_



identifiable in published material by the Government. To this has to be added an estimated \$0.370B for 20 years of O&M,² for a total projected cost of \$1.66B, for 1.7 km of track.

To put this enormous sum into perspective, the equivalent build cost for Stage 1 from Gungahlin to Civic was \$69.2M per km. The figure for Stage 2A is \$305M per km (\$519M/2). How the Government can accept such a huge jump in construction costs demands answers, but none can be expected to be forthcoming. It should at least make public the cost composition of the \$577M contract, especially whether it includes 20 years of O&M, but is expected, as usual, to hide behind contract confidentiality.

Stage 2B

Based on the comparative build cost figures for Stages 1 and 2A, estimates for the build of Stage 2B is notionally taken as \$150M for each of its 10.1 km. However, this assumed figure could well be in considerable error.

This translates into a cost for build, related contracts and administration of \$2.33B plus \$1.172B for O&M, for an expected total of \$3.5B.

Stage 2B - Mawson extension

A mooted extension from Woden town centre to Mawson (2km) would add an extra \$0.55B over construction plus 20 years of O&M.

Stage 2

Together, Stages 2A and 2B could reach \$5.163B, including 20 years of O&M.

Stage 1 and Stage 2

Together, Stages 1 and 2 could reach \$6.943B, including 20 years of O&M.

Financial Commitment to date.

It can be shown, from published records, that the financial commitment (approved expenditure) to date for light rail has been \$1.78B nominal (\$1.311B PV, Jan24³) for Stage 1 and \$1.496B for Stage 2, for a verifiable total of \$3.276B.

| Table 1 | | | | |
|--|-----------------|--------------|----------------|-------|
| Light Rail Canberra | | | | |
| Summary-Cost estimates (8Mar24) | | | | |
| | Build + | 20Y | 20Y | |
| | Project | O&M | Total | Notes |
| Stage | \$B | \$B | \$B | |
| | | | | |
| \$Commitment to date | | | 3.276 | 0 |
| Stage 1 | | | 1.780 | 1 |
| Stage 2 | | | 1.496 | 2 |
| Stages 1 & 2 | | | 6.943 | |
| Stage 1 | | | 1.780 | |
| Stage 2 - Civic-Woden | 3.621 | 1.542 | 5.163 | |
| Stage 2A | 1.291 | 0.370 | 1.661 | 3, 4 |
| Stage 2B - Regatta Point-Woden | 2.330 | 1.172 | 3.502 | 5 |
| Stage 2B Mawson extension | 0.324 | 0.226 | 0.550 | 6 |
| | | | | |
| Notes: | | | | |
| Incudes attendant non-build contracts, | consultancies | and proje | ect managem | ent |
| 1. Auditor-General Report on Stage 1, June | 2016. \$1.78 I | 3 nominal | ; \$0.913B PV2 | 2016 |
| 2. Includes \$519M build contract plus atte | ndant contrac | ts commit | ted to date | |
| 3. \$519M build contract plus attendant cor | trcts for tram | s, facilitie | s and services | 5 |
| 4. O&M at 50% of build, equipment & faci | lities (margina | al costs or | Stage 1) | |
| 5. O&M at 75% of build, equipment & faci | lities | | | |

² While not published, one can expect four of the five extra trams to be operated three shifts per day. This will require at least 20 drivers at a cost of \$150K pa each (salary \$75K), for 20 years, being \$60 million for drivers alone.

6. O&M at 75% of build, equipment & facilities

^{3 .} https://www.tenders.act.gov.au/contract/view?id=130871, click "Attachments", Variation #5



Summary

When are Canberrans ever going to wake up to how we are taxpayers are being fleeced on light rail by the sole-source, contractor/unions consortium, with the impotent compliance of the Labor/Greens government. It can be shown from published sources that, to date, some \$3.27B has been committed (much of it spent) on Stage1 (\$1.78B) and on stage 2 planning and build contracts (\$1.496B).

To date, \$1.29B has been committed for Stage 2A (Civic-Regatta Point) for planning and a build contract alone. To this must be added the Operations & Maintenance (O&M) (20 years nominal) of \$0.370B, for a total cost of Stage 2A of \$1.66B. Not bad for 1.7km of track. For comparison (and a source of wonder), Stage 1 (12km) cost \$69M per km to build. Stage 2A (1.7km) will be \$305M per km to build (excluding raising London Circuit). How could that be short of snouts in the trough?

The outrageous contract price of \$519M to build Stage 2A (excluding raising London Circuit, five extra trams and facilities), for only 1.7km has prompted a revision of probable costs of Stage 2B, Regatta Point to Woden. The most probable build cost now for Stage 2B (10.1km) is \$2.33B. By the time 20 years of O&M and off contract expenditures are included, Stage 2B will be about \$3.5B.

An extension from Woden to Mawson (2km) would be another \$0.32B to build plus \$0.226B for a total of \$0.55B.

All up (build plus 20 years O&M), Stage 2 to Woden will be about \$5.16B (\$1.66B for 2A and \$3.5B for 2B. All up (build plus 20 years O&M), Stages 1 & 2 to be about \$6.94B (\$1.78B for Stage 1 and \$5.16B for Stage 2).

Hair-raising stuff!

M.R. Flint Principal, Australian Logistics Study Centre, an Coordinator, Smart Canberra Transport Canberra, 11 March 2024



| | | | | | | Constants | 1.230 | Esc factor 2016/2023 |
|--|---|------------------------|-----------------------------|------------------|--------------|-----------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|
| | Major assumption ba on St1 and St2A kn | | Reference | 3% pa for 7 y | ears | \$M/Km | \$M | Work |
| | costs | | Stage 1 actua | l build cost (20 | 016 prices) | 56.3 | | 12Km Track & Stations |
| TABLE 2 [Part 1] | | | Stage 1 actua | Lbuild cost (20 | 023 prices) | 69.2 | | 12Km Track & Stations |
| LIGHT RAIL COST ESTIMATES - BUILD AND PLANNING | | Stage 2A actu | al build cost (| 2023 prices) | 305.3 | | 1.7Km Track & Stations | |
| STAGE 1 - GUNGAHLIN-CIVIC | | | Stage 2B actu | al build cost (2 | 2023 prices) | 150.0 | | 10.1 Km Track & Stations |
| STAGE 2A - CIVIC-REGATTA POINT | | Australian Cases (max) | | 2] | 7.5 | Intersection + Lights | | |
| STAGE 2B - REGATTA POINT TO WODEN | TOWN CENTRE | | Australian Cases (min) [| | [2] | 4.0 | | |
| STAGE 2B EXTENSION - WODEN TO MAY | WSON | | BITRE Report (See Table A3) | | 4.7 | | Earthworks (signif) | |
| | | | BITRE Report | (See Table A3 |) | 6.6 | | Earthworks (major) |
| ESTIMATES UPDATED 8MAR24 | | | BITRE Report (See Table A3) | | 8.4 | | Earthworks(extens) | |
| POST ACTUAL CONTRACT PRICE FOR STA | AGE 2A CONSTRUCT | TION | 1. Based on a | ctual contract | ed build cos | st of \$675M | (2016 prices | 3) |
| | | | 2. Sunshine C | oast Council (| up to \$5M); | Victorian g | overnment | (\$5M to \$11M) |
| | | | | | | Build | | |
| Stage | | | | | | Estimate | [note] | Stops |
| Leg | | Km | V | Vork required | | \$M | Comments | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| Stage 1 & Stage 2 Commitment (at 10M | ar240 | | | | | 3,276 | | |
| Stage 1 Commitment | | | \$69M per km | (build only) | | 1,780 | 0; 1 | |
| Stage 2 Commitment | | | | | | 1,496 | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| Stages 2A, 2B + 2B Extension to Mawsor | 1 | 13.8 | | | | 3,945 | | |
| Stages 2A, 2B | | 11.8 | \$306M per Kr | n (build only) | | 3,621 | | |
| Stages 2A | | 1.7 | \$305 per Km | construct only | /) | 1,290.8 | | |
| Construction, Equipment, facilities | | | [exclused rais | sing London C | ct] | 732.0 | | |
| Construction contract | | | | | | 519.0 | 2 | |
| More trams, expand depot, retrofit b | oatteries | | | | | 199.0 | 3 | |
| Certification | | | | | | 14.0 | 4 | |
| Planning and administration | | | | | | 374.3 | | |
| Stage 1 and 2A interface contract "Tr | ipartite Deed | | | | | 162.0 | 5 | |
| Augmentation Deed Stage 2A | | | | | | 7.7 | 6 | |
| Augmentation Deed Stage 2A | | | | | | 7.3 | 7 | |
| Stage 2A Advice | | | | | | 2.7 | 8 | |
| Stage 2A development agreement | | | | | | 7.2 | 9 | |
| Augmentation Deed Stage 2A | | | | | | 9.4 | 10 | |
| Project Design and Technical Advisor | ry Consultant | | | | | 93.0 | 11 | |
| Technical Advisors Panel contract, | | | | | | 85.0 | 12 | |
| Enabling Works | | | | | | 82.0 | | |
| Raising London Cct | | | | | | 82.0 | 13 | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| | | | | | | | | |
| Stage 2A Planning | | 50% | Stage 2A port | ion of Stage 2 | planning | 102.5 | | |
| | | | | | | | | |



| Table 2 [Part 2] | | | | | |
|---|------|--|--------------|----|-----------------------|
| Stage 2 Planning | | | 205.0 | | |
| Stage 2 Planning Project Design, TechAdvisory Consultant City to Woden | | | 93.0 | 14 | |
| Technical Advisors Panel contract, Nov 2017 - June 2024 | | | 95.0 85.0 | 15 | |
| Working on stage 2 since 2016 | | | 27.0 | 16 | |
| Working on Stage 2 Since 2010 | | | 27.0 | 10 | |
| Stage 2B + 2B Extension to Mawson | 12.1 | | 2,654 | | |
| Stage 2B | | [Assumes graded right-of-way] | 2,330 | | |
| Stage 2B Planning | | | 103 | | |
| All Track (10.1Km) + Stations | 10.1 | \$150 per KM | 1,515 | | |
| Regatta Point to Comm Ave bridge | 0.25 | Earthworks (significant) | 1 | | |
| Reworked intersection and traffic lights | | | 8 | | 1. Hyatt Hotel |
| Bridge across lake | 0.3 | | 350 | 17 | |
| Lake to State Cct | 1.25 | | 13 | | |
| Leaves Cth Ave at Coronation Dve | | Intersection and lights | 8 | | |
| Along left side of Cth Ave to State Cir | | Earthworks (significant) | 6 | | |
| State Ccr to Adelaide Ave | 2.3 | Forthworks (significant) | 72 | | |
| To State Cir | | Earthworks (significant) | 11 8 | | |
| Over State Cir to inside thereof Under two Mall bridges | | Intersection and lights MUST fit - work on bridges not feasible | _ | | |
| To Kings Ave | | Intersection and lights | e 8 | | 2. Kings Ave |
| To Sydney Ave | | [no intersection] | 0 | | 3. Sydney Ave |
| To Canberra Ave | | Intersection and lights | 8 | | J. Sydney Ave |
| To Melbourne Ave | | Intersection and lights | 8 | | 4. Melbourne Ave |
| To Capital Cir (under or over?) | | Bridge or Intersection and lights | 20 | | |
| Up onto Adelaide Ave (centre) | | Earthworks (significant) | 11 | | |
| Along centre of Adelaide Ave | 2 | | 119 | | |
| To Yarra Glen | | Earthworks (significant) | 9 | | |
| To Hopetoun Cct bridge (Over) | | Centre bridge span required | 50 | | 5. Hopetoun Cct |
| Ditto | | Footbridge/elevator access | 20 | | |
| Novar St bridge (under) | | Rework of bridge supports possible | 20 | | 6. Novar St |
| Ditto | | Footbridge/elevator access | 20 | | |
| Along centre of Yarra Glen | 2.75 | Earthworks (major) | 28 | | |
| Yarra Glen/Yamba Dve roundabout | | Earthworks (major) | 18 | | |
| Carruthers St bridge | | Rework of bridge supports needed | 10 | | 7. Carruthers St |
| Across roundabout 0.75 km | 0.75 | | 106 | | |
| Across culverts etc | | Earthworks (extensive) | 6 | | |
| Ditto | | Bridging (extensive) | 100 | | |
| Launceston St to Bradle St | 0.5 | | 15 | | 8 Canberra College |
| Callum St | | Intersection and lights | 8 | | |
| Bowes St Town Centre | | Intersection and lights | 8 | | 9 Terminal Woden |
| Stage 2B Extension to Mawson (2Km) | | \$150M per KM | 324 | | 9 Terrifinal Woderi |
| All Track (2Km) + Stations | 2 | 3130W PET KIVI | 300 | | |
| Extra work | _ | | 24 | | |
| Bradle St to Neptune St | | Intersection and lights | 4 | | |
| Neptune St to Corinna St | | Intersection and lights | 4 | | 10. Parramatta St (?) |
| Corinna St to Hindmarsh Dve | | Intersection and lights | 4 | | , , |
| Centre of Athlon Dve to Shea St | | Intersection and lights | 4 | | |
| Centre of Athlon Dve to Melrose Dve | | Intersection and lights | 4 | | |
| Centre of Athlon Dve to Mawson Dve | | Intersection and lights and Terminal | 4 | | 11 Terminal Woden |
| Notes: | | | | | |
| O. Auditor-General report Stage 1, june 2016 | | | | | |
| 1. https://www.tenders.act.gov.au/contract/view?id=1308 | | k "Attachments", Variation #5 | | | Stage 1 |
| 2. https://www.tenders.act.gov.au/contract/view?id=2102 | 200 | | | | |
| 3. Exact reference to be located | 101 | | | | 1.0 |
| 1. https://www.tenders.act.gov.au/contract/view?id=210 | 191 | | | | 14 |
| Tripartite deed - exact reference to be located https://www.tenders.act.gov.au/contract/view?id=184 | 674 | | | | |
| 5. https://www.tenders.act.gov.au/contract/view?id=184 7. https://www.tenders.act.gov.au/contract/view?id=1860 | | | | | |
| 3. https://www.tenders.act.gov.ad/contract/view?id=1929 | | | | | |
| D. https://www.tenders.act.gov.au/contract/view?id=1997 | _ | | | | |
| 10. https://www.tenders.act.gov.au/contract/view?id=1997 | | | | | |
| 11. https://www.tenders.act.gov.au/contract/view?id=203 | | | | | |
| 12. https://www.tenders.act.gov.au/contract/view?id=151 | | | | | |
| 13. https://www.tenders.act.gov.au/contract/view?id=199 | | | | | |
| | | i a | | | |
| | 320 | | | | |
| 14 https://www.tenders.act.gov.au/contract/view?id=1908 | | | | | |
| 14 https://www.tenders.act.gov.au/contract/view?id=190 15. https://www.tenders.act.gov.au/contract/view?id=15 16. https://www.canberratimes.com.au/story/6033674/ac | 1511 | nment-signs-suite-of-light-rail-stage-2- | contracts/ | | |